Foreign concepts: indexing and indexes on the Continent

Michael Robertson

The British Standard was recently taken as the basis for the new International Standard for indexing, but unexpected cultural differences may still continue to produce surprisingly non-standard results. Examples of indexes from recent Continental European books show that they typically have multiple indexes in multiple volumes, long lists of unanalysed page references, and Jack cross-referencing to related concepts.

It may seem strange, in this era of alleged European Union, to speak of the Continent as being a place that harbours 'foreign concepts'. However, my point is that, by the time the reader has finished this paper, he or she will be wondering whether Continental Europe is actually on the same planet as that inhabited by the Anglo-Saxon (or at least, by the Anglo-Saxon indexer).

Many people who go to live abroad tend to assimilate almost completely to their new environment. In my experience, however—having lived in Germany for nearly fourteen years, and having worked in publishing there for seven years—when one lives abroad for a longer period, instead of becoming more and more familiar with the host country and its ways, after a certain point one comes instead to appreciate every slight and much more fully how unfathomably strange it is.

I shall be illustrating this here in connection with indexing on the continent under six headings: (1) Culture shock; (2) French books do have indexes; (3) The Amsterdam en dash; (4) Yangquang, but not very good Technik; (5) The M-Ahorn en dash; and (6) Culture shock 2: the front initials.

Culture shock

Figure 1 shows part of a German card file system. Open-minded as we are, we might think that separating out 'Sch' and 'St' might be quite a handy way of subdividing a file of names and addresses in German, rather in the same way that the 'Mac' names are sometimes separated in English card files and address books. But of course, nobody would dream of alphabetizing a file of cards for a book index in that way; would they?

Yes, they would. Figure 2a shows part of the index to a book that I happen to know has several references to the philosopher Schopenhauer in it.

Figure 1 A German card file system.

The Indexer Vol. 19 No. 3 April 1995.

Figure 2 The Indexer Vol. 19 No. 3 April 1995.

R S Sch St T


Appropriately the index has missed them. Or has it? By chance, the eye runs down to the foot of the column (Figure 2b), where we suddenly notice that at the end of the letter 'S', 'Stroddi' is followed by Schachtel, while in the following column 'Schwarzhild' is followed by Staiger.

At this stage one might still presume that separating 'Sch' and 'St' must be in extremely eccentric rarity only occurring in this book, or at worst, perhaps, only used in name indexes. Alas no (Figure 3a)—even in the indexes to cookbooks. Schachtel follows Stroddi. Galasch, and Stacherl-Chatzky follows Schwarzhild (Figure 2b). At this stage, an Anglo-Saxon mind with pedantic tendencies may already be starting to feel that its sanity is under threat, and it consults an educated native German informant. The educated native informant, however, finds it absolutely natural for indexes and keys to be alphabetized in this way: would think it strange for it to be done any other way, and can't understand at all why anyone would think of calling it into question. What emerges is that a fundamental cultural presupposition, which one simply assumes, that western European countries must have largely in common—the indivisibility of the letter 'S'—is unworkable.

When we cross the Channel, therefore, we are not simply moving from one area of homogenized modern mass Eurocultural culture to another, largely indistinguishable from it; we will probably need to discard many of our preconceptions and subconscious assumptions. This is probably just as true today as it was for travellers to the continent fifty or a hundred years ago, despite the sense of internationalism that the European Union has provided.
French books do have indexes

It was to be expected by Nancy Mitford among others that French books never have indexes. If that were so in the past, a quick survey which I have carried out of French non-fiction and academic books indicates that things may be gradually beginning to change. Both in France and Germany, book reviewers have, at least in recent years, occasionally been known to lament the omission of indexes in non-fiction books. Provision of an index of some sort is the rule rather than the exception in German non-fiction publishing, and it is not in fact an absolute rarity in France, either.

What we see in Figure 4 is part of the index to the first volume of a biography of de Gaulle in three 800-page volumes. It is an index of names only, and there is no subject index. The index to each volume contains some 4,000 individual location references, representing around five index items extracted per page. The introductory footnote claims that the pressure of space has meant that only the major names mentioned in the text, those of the principal figures of the story, could be included; historians and journalists, it says, have had to be excluded. A note at the head of the index to the second volume states that only contemporary entries are included, while at the head of the index to the third volume there is no introductory note, although it seems likely that similar restrictions applied. Two characteristics of this index are found generally in a range of French indexes I have examined: first, each volume of a multi-volume work is indexed separately, and a general index is not provided, and secondly (Figure 5), there is no limit except the size of the book to the number of unanalysed location references that can follow a heading—a practice condemned in British indexing as long ago as 1902 by Wheatley, and of which Knight says, ‘Nothing could be more futile or more infuriating to the would-be user.’

Another index to a three-volume French biography (Figure 6), in this case of Victor Hugo, while it does provide a general index to all three volumes, divides it into two parts, the first being an index to the works of Victor Hugo and the second a general index of names, works, and journals. A major flaw here again is the way in which the unanalysed location references are virtually limitless.

The Indexer Vol. 19 No. 3 April 1995

161
INDEXING AND INDEXES ON THE CONTINENT

The index to a three-volume French encyclopedia of zoology produced in the Pélée series epitomizes these three tendencies—separate indexing of each volume, division into several indexes, and failure to analyze location references. Each one of the three volumes contains (in this order): its own alphabetical index of species names; its own alphabetical subject index; a systematic, not alphabetical, analytical table of the various concepts discussed, including page references; then follows a "table of illustrations" and finally there is the table of contents, which, as in most French books, appears at the very end. A user of the book looking for all the references to a particular species is therefore going to have to go to each separate volume, search somewhere two-thirds of the way through the book for the subject index, abandon that search and go to the species index, and may then need to plough through dozens of location references, before starting the whole process again in the following volume.

Before leaving France we can look briefly at two further indexes. An edition of de Gaulle's letters and notebooks includes an index (Figure 7) with the peculiar feature that it incorporates a biographical dictionary of the correspondents. The page references that follow the biographical details indicate letters to those specific correspondents, but the contexts of the letters themselves, and any personal mention in them, are not indexed. Once again, there are unanalyzed sequences of up to 35 location references.

A final visit to France (Figure 8) will illustrate another feature common to continental indexes—the use of the abbreviations "ff." or "sq." to indicate a page range, a practice which the British Standard considers for its impracticality. This index, the length of which again indicates that around five index items per page have been extracted, is presented in five columns of six-point type. In the first I have enlarged a few lines to make them clearer. The introductory note at the top states that location references to whole chapters are given in bold, and that numbers followed by an abbreviation "sq" for "sequentielle" means "and the following pages".

These examples are typical of the indexes to many other French books and it's clear, therefore, that there is a range of practices that are quite contrary to those recommended by the British Standard, which formed the basis for the recently approved second edition of the International Standard, ISO 999, which is currently in press.

Although my command of Italian and Spanish is sparse at non-existent, I have also examined a small sample of indexes in Italian and Spanish books, and found the same characteristics as those in French ones. Multiple indexes in multiple volumes, lack of analyzed page references extending far beyond the maximum of seven recommended by Knight; and the use of "ff." or "sq." abbreviations, are all common fea-

Suppen (Kochlehre) .................. 66
 dicke .................................. 301
 gebundene ................................ 81
 klare .................................. 69
 sätze .................................. 96
 Suppenwürzen ...................... 60
 Szegediiner Gulasch ........ 117
 .. (Entopf) ..................... 308

Sch
 Schalentiere ................................ 256
 Schakartoffeln ................. 417
 Schaschlik ......................... 242

Figure 3a: Muaa Hoffmann and Helmut Lobsin, Bayerisches Kochbuch Mannh, Birkem-Verlag, 1986. (The asterisk indicates a quick recipe.)

Süd-saure Vanille-Kirschen 237
 Süß-saure Würz-Quitten 243

Sch
 Schalotten, Rotwein, süd-säuer 228
 Schafpolnische Gurken 226
 Schlenken, allgemein 192
 Schleschen-Äpfelsäurer 195
 Schleschen-Gelee 101
 Schleschen-Gin 193
 Schlesw-Sirup 139
 Schlesw.Kochbok, Eisarten 177
 Schwarze Johannesbeeren, Gelee von 40
 Schwarze Johannesbeeren, Likör aus 189
 Schwarze Johannesbeer-Marmelade, foh gerührte 41
 Schwalber Sahnereis 184

Stabin
 Stachelbeere-Chutney 252
 Stachelbeer-Gelee mit Minze 21

Figure 3b: Eisen und Trinken-Reaktion, ed., Einwech. Hamburg Grinner & Jahr, 1986. (The italics indicate general dish-reactions.)
603-604, 611, 620, 624-624, 734.
Astor, David, 407.
Axtel, Clement, 367, 777.
Auboyneau, Philippe, 494, 503, 618.
Aubrac, Lucie, 726, 734.
Aubrac, Raymond, 582, 719, 725, 725, 757, 807.
Aubry, Henry, 719.
Auphan, Gabriel, 461, 614, 609.
Auriol, Vincent, 735, 759.
Avrin, Antoine, 382.
Bergeret, Jean, 302, 380, 381, 458, 478, 460-621, 623, 634-635, 637, 663, 682, 754.
Bergey, Gaston, 289, 354.
Bergeron, Henri, 21, 52-55, 143, 152.
Berl, Adolp, 536, 540.
Berlot, Andre, 163, 169.
Bertinot, Georges, 375.
Bonstein, Henry, 389, 516, 339.
Berque, Jacques, 751.
Bertaux, Pierre, 369.
Bevcond, commandant, 311, 317.
Belhouque, Emilie, 36, 40, 392, 596, 778-778, 778-781, 790.

1. Les exigences de la mise en page nous ont contraints à ne saisir que les principaux noms cités, ceux des personnages du drame, à l'exception des historiens et journalistes.

Figure 4 Jean Lautrec, De Gaulle, vol. 1: Le rebelle, 1890-1944 Paris, Seuil, 1984.


Figure 5 Jean Lautrec, De Gaulle, vol. 1: Le rebelle, 1890-1944 Paris, Seuil, 1984.


Figure 6 Robert Jérusalem, Victor Hugo. Paris Flammarion, 1986. 3 vol.

The Index Vol. 19 No 3 April 1995

The Amsterdam en dash

Before going on to Vossius durch Technik, we can make a brief stop in Amsterdam (Figure 9). I am most grateful to Eric van Broeckhoven of the Amsterdam publishers Rodopi, the only company that responded to inquiries on indexing practices which I also sent to a number of prestigious academic and non-fiction publishers in Paris, Turin, Barcelona, and Madrid.

Rodopi produce between 100 and 120 books per year with indexes, and the examples they sent me show that, like French indexes, they can have quite long page reference sequences and quite liberal use of "dash"


this proposition, production will still be halted with desperate photographic cells being made until the publishing company and various typesetters get used to it.

Then comes the problem of run-on lines. Having got used to the idea of indenting, the typesetters are flabbergasted to start enjoying it too much and will take it to the extreme when a heading is too long for the column, starting the following line five or six em spaces in, half-way along the line or more even when there is only one level of subheading.

Then comes the problem of stage referencing. If you are producing a book in American English, you may want the page references to be abridged in Chicago manual style (Figure 11a). Assuming that by this time the typesetters have been made complacent to the extent that they won't just automatically set page ranges in full, there is still no way that this system is going to pass a German proofreading department, because the second number in the range varies between one figure and two, depending on whether it is less than one hundred or above or below 10 in multiples of a hundred.

The fourteenth edition of the Chicago manual now for the first time offers an alternative system in which the second number in the range only gives the changed page of the first number (Figure 11b). However, in British practice Harr's rules makes an exception to this for numbers in the range 10-19 in each hundred. (210-11, 711-1F). Either of these systems, the Chicago no. 2 style or Harr's rules, should pass the test of German typesetters and proofreaders without causing a hiccup in the production process during the last-minute stages when indexes are being produced.

But we're still not out of the woods (Figure 12). If you follow standard indexing recommendations to distinguish between detailed and cumulative treatment of a topic (using a page range) and individualpassing references (using a set of page numbers), you are still going to find proofs grinding to a halt in a continental publishing company until the inconsistency between the two is clarified. I did once attempt to explain this distinction to a member of a German journal's production department, but to judge by the expression of disbelief on his face, he quite obviously thought I had just invented the idea on the spot as an excuse for editorial carelessness. This spirit was a case of culture shock.

The conclusive solution to all these difficulties, of course, is to produce a house style specification for English-language lists and submit it to typesetters and proofreaders with each index, or as a standing specification. But this conclusion can only be reached once one has learned from experience that everyone else is working on a completely different set of presuppositions.

This is where we come to the Verlag. There's an excellent little book, more or less the German equivalent of Harr's rules, published by Oudin in the plan

21, 23, 41, 44, 47, 52, 67, 84-
93, 97, 100, 106, 111, 118-138,
143, 148, 149, 153, 154, 166,
167, 179, 181, 185, 194, 196
author of – 122, 181, 196
critic of – 122, 181, 196
counselling – 124
e external – 124
internal – 124
making plans 5, 46, 77, 97, 100,
118, 120, 135, 141
policy – 124
pre-existent – 131, 133
reconstruction of a – 132
rephrasal of a – 121, 123, 127, 128,
130, 137, 142, 205
planning
interactive – 77, 84, 109, 110

Figure 10 Tom Knoke and Jan D. ten Thije, The construction of a multicultural dictionary. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1992.


The Indexer Vol. 19 No. 3 April 1995

165
German city of Mannheim—the authority equivalent in Germany to Oxford University Press in Britain and the University of Chicago Press in the USA. Six of the book’s 274 pages are devoted to indexing, and we may quote the introduction to the section at length:

A book is only complete when it has an index. The optimium usage and practical usefulness of a specialist text is a non-fiction book, and particularly of scholarly and scientific works, are only established when an index of names and subjects sums up the materials in the text. The table of contents alone is not an adequate guide. The lack of an index is a severe restriction to the study of a work and to its capacity for being cited and referred to. The user cannot be expected to read the whole of a book through in order to locate a specific text or quotation.

Publishers are well aware that the sales of their books may be reduced substantially by the lack of an index. Why, then, do specialist texts and scholarly and scientific books continue to appear without indexes? Usually the authors, the publisher, or the editors are more reluctant to carry out the apparently unprofitable task of indexing than they are afraid of the costs involved. In addition, there is a lack of qualified staff capable of producing a carefully prepared index on a rational plan.

There is a challenge to potential indexers in that last sentence that has, many years after the book was first published, not been met as it ideally might have been by the emergence of an army of German freelance indexers. I’ve had by chance met a couple of indexers of German books over the years, one of whom was still working with paper slips (not index cards) and after 20 years of medical indexing felt seriously under-appreciated both by publishers and by authors. Both she and another indexer I have spoken to who was employed on the indexing of a daily newspaper, the Süddeutsche Zeitung seem completely baffled by the idea that there might be an organization abroad in which indexers were able to meet to exchange and improve ideas, and they found the idea of an entire scholarly journal being devoted to the subject precisely as strange as the average man in the street does. So there is probably a vicious circle operating, in which under-appreciation from publishers and authors produces under-appraisal of indexers’ own work—which I think it’s right to say is widely seen in German publishing as being a kind of menial or secretarial task, although certainly an important one, associated with book publishing.

But what sort of index is it that the Duden guidelines are proposing (Figure 13)? Since this example from the book shows a rather name and subject index, it’s not as straightforward as the introduction just quoted may have suggested that the principle of ‘one book, one index’ is being applied. There are no explicit restrictions on the number of location references that can follow a heading, and under ‘Bernstein’ here there are twelve. The guidelines disapprove of the ‘improper’ use of the abbreviation ‘i’ as a locator for a preceding sequence of pages, but they do approve the use of the single ‘I’ to indicate the immediate following page. Bold type in the location references is used to indicate principal references to a person or subject, but the guidelines only indicate that in their instructions on typesetting, not in the instructions to the indexer on how to prepare the index physically—so that it seems to be expected that the bold may only need to be added at proof stage.

All in all, though, we can see that, as far as indexing goes, Germany clearly has the Vorprung even on other continental countries. However, halfway down the right-hand column in Figure 13 we can see what I shall call the Mannheim en dash—which is where it has the not very good Technik.

The Mannheim en dash

You may be wondering why there are three dashes under Allgemeiner Deutscher Arbeiterverein, and not just one, since the subheading is only at one conceptual level below it. The reason is, of course, that in this style the dash, like the Amsterdam en dash we saw earlier, works like the tilde in a bilingual dictionary and refers only to a single word, not to the whole heading as a single concept. The first dash is for Außeneinander, the second for Deutscher, and the third for Arbeiterverein. This is the standard style for the subordination of subheadings used in German indexes.

In Figure 14, therefore, a German and an Anglo-Saxon index user are going to read the index entry in two completely different ways, and they are going to be mutually unaware that it’s happening. An Anglo-Saxon is likely to read the subheading sequence angi 11 as meaning ‘opening of the aortic hiatus’, ‘sinus of the aortic hiatus’, and ‘valve of the aortic hiatus’, and everything that we know about indexes from a lifetime of reading books and using the indexes in them tells us to read it in that way. However, all of those expressions are anatomically meaningless. What the dash actually refers to is only the single first word of the main heading, and what the subheadings say is actually ‘aortic opening’, ‘aortic sinus’, and ‘aortic valve’.

We can look at a few examples of this system at work, both from indexes prepared by medical authors. In Figure 15a, it becomes clear that there is no syste...
Beispielen:

Namensverzeichnis

Abendroth, Wolfgang 279, 297
Adler, Viktor 17, 240, 252, 258, 276, 278, 297
Adoratski, Wladimir 11, 18, 22
Allard, Helmut 22
Allen, Amelia 68 f.
Angerer, Leopold 264
Auer, Ignaz 20, 147, 161, 167, 187, 192, 197, 226, 257, 283
Aveling, Eduard 207, 210, 249
Aveling-Marx, Eleanor 20, 207, 210, 248, 252, 261
Axelrod, Paul B. 99, 297
Bebel, August 147, 192
Becker, Johann Philipp 20, 50, 52–54, 85, 93, 99, 133, 220
Beier, Gerhard 297
Bernbeck, Gerhard 279
Biskamp, Elard 71 f., 76
Bismarck, Otto von 14 f., 78, 80, 86, 92, 116 f., 121, 125 f., 132

Sachverzeichnis

Abschaffung der Kinderarbeit 244
Achtstundentag 244
ADAV s. Allgemeiner Deutscher Arbeiterverein
Agitationsreise nach Amerika 206–210
Agrarfrage 247, 254, 293
Allgemeiner Deutscher Arbeiterverein 79–85, 90–92, 101, 112, 114, 121 f., 190
Allgemeiner Deutscher Gewerkschaftsverband 218
Arbeiterbörse 244
Arbeiterfrage, Bemerkungen Wilhelms II. 245
Arbeitergesetzgebung 223
Arbeiterklasse 173, 213–226, 260, 296
Arbeitertagung Berlin (1848) 213
Arbeiterschaften 214, 218
Arbeiterschutz antrag 192
Arbeiterschutzgesetzgebung 239, 244


The Indexer Vol. 19 No. 3 April 1995 167
Aortic hiatus – opening
sinus – valve

Figure 14 The Mannheim et al. valve

Switching from the sciences to the humanities, finally
steronhoophys. and sternothypoides 9ff.
Musculus: adductor brevis 221, 225
– magnus 195, 221
– adductor magnus 183ff., 193ff., 223, 227
– magnus 185, 197ff., 219, 223ff.

Figure 15: German medical index.

(although there’s no distinction in German between these two concepts, which are both Wissenschaft, we can look at the index to a German translation of a French philosophy book (Figure 15). At first sight it looks formally slightly more like an English-style index. The dash here is not used in the Mannheim style, but simply as a visual indication of the start of a subheading, since the words ‘international’ and ‘philosophical’, for example, are repeated in the subheading texts. However, there are long strings of location references again, use of ‘f.’ and ‘ff.’, and ‘f.', in addition to explicit page ranges, and again the book contains separate indexes of subjects and names instead of a single index. However, as can be seen from the enlarged inset, it does have one feature that’s unique in the German indexes I have examined: its use of the abbreviation ‘vgl.’ for ‘vergleiche’, ‘compare’—the equivalent of our ‘cf’. Abbreviation—to point the user to related terms.)
Sachverzeichnis

Acetabulum 179
Aortica 3
Ara sulci sacrals 145
Ampulla ductus deferentis 187ff., 209ff.,
213ff.
Arteria 131
Ara 215
Arteria abdominalis 61ff., 77ff., 91ff., 137ff.,
153ff., 203ff., 227
- ascendens 253ff., 31ff., 39, 57, 75
Arteria pulmonalis 61, 79ff.
Arteria recta 211ff., 59ff., 77ff.
- venae jugulares 57ff.
Arteriae sacrals 3, 13, 79ff.
- brachiales 85ff.
- carotis communis 45ff.
- - - dextra 55ff., 79ff.
- - - sinistra 61, 77ff.
- - extrema sinistra 61
- - - sinistra sinistra 61
- - vertebrale superficialis 70ff.
- circumflexa femoris lateralis 181ff., 227
- - - - (R. ascendens) 179
- - - - - superficialis 191ff.
- colica dextra 125
- - media 113
- - coronaria dextra 30ff., 57ff., 71, 139ff.
- - - (R. interventriculaires posterior) 49
- - - sinistra 39, 61ff., 77
- - - (R. circumflexa) 45
- - - - (R. interventriculaires anterior) 41ff.,
41ff., 73
- epigastrica inferior 165ff., 195, 229
- femoralis 227ff.
- - profunda 195
- - superficialis 193
- femoralis profunda 181ff., 227
- gastria dextra 99, 105
- - posterior 95
- - - sinistra 77, 101, 105, 155
- - gastroepiploica 83, 130ff., 141
- - glutea inferior 193ff., 215ff.
- - - superior 155, 193, 217
- hepatica 131, 155
- - communis 95, 159ff.
- - - profunda 133
- - iliea communis 207
- - communis dextra 131ff., 199ff., 227
- - - sinistra 125, 159ff., 199ff.
- - extera 129, 193ff., 207, 229
- - - dextra 131, 143ff.
- - - interna 153ff., 197, 207, 221, 225
- - - dextra 131ff., 197
- - - sinistra 137
- - intercostalis 81, 85
- - - posterior 151
- - intervertebralis 87
- - jejunalis 135
- - luminae 137, 153ff., 193, 223
- - mesenterica inferior 79, 125ff., 161
- - - superior 75ff., 107ff., 157, 157ff.
- - - subcostalis 177
- - ovaria 197
- - pulmonalis profunda penis 231ff.
- - phrenica inferior dextra 95
- - - - sinistra 95
- - - profunda femoris 229
- - pudenda interna 159, 195, 215
- - pulmonalis 67
- - - dextra 27ff., 35, 53ff., 81ff.
- - - sinistra 27ff., 65, 81ff.
- - rectalis media 159, 217
- - - superior 155
- - renalis 147
- - - dextra 113ff., 131ff., 157
- - - sinistra 115, 135, 159
- - - - - sacrals 203
- - - superficialis 93, 101ff., 139ff., 153ff., 159
- - - subclavia 78ff., 63, 67ff.
- - - - - sinistra 9, 65, 71ff.
- - suprarenalis 77
- - testiculis 237
- - thoracica interna 19, 61, 71, 75ff.
- - thoracica 179ff.
- - und V. sacrals 5, 77
- - - - - epigastrica profunda 27ff.
- - - - - circumflexa femoris lateralis 183ff.
- - - - - iliea superficialis 179
- - - - - epigastrica inferior 171ff.
- - - - - - superficialis 179ff.
- - - - - femoralis 179ff.
- - - - - gastria sinistra 99, 105ff.
- - - - - glutea inferior 173ff., 179
- - - - - - glutea superior 173, 219
- - - - - iliea 147, 197, 201, 205ff.
- - - - - iliea communis 163ff.
- - - - - externa 167ff.
- - - - interna 167ff., 195, 219, 223

Figure 1a German medical index.

The Index of Vol. 19 No. 3 April 1995 169
Philosophie (philosophie) 137, 185–208, 212, 236, 260, 3021, 329

– abendländische, europäische Philosophie (philosophie occidentale, européenne) 187 f., 195, 203, 211 f., 296, 313

– Philosophie der Existenz (philosophie de l’existence) 64, 105 f., 132, vgl. Existenzialisismus

Jilmenerauerstraße

Jüdischenstraße

Figure 19a An ‘i’ with c curve on it.

Figure 19b More of the German card file system.

References
The following note, which indexes everywhere will find latter and appear in the editorial of the Transactions of the Halifiz Antiquarian Society, new series, volume 1, 1913.

Another traditional feature has been abandoned, namely the concubine subject index, which in most years has sometimes contributed to the delay in the publication of the Transactions. In order to do justice to the increasing volume of material now being published, a considerably enlarged and more fully differentiated index than has appeared in previous years would be required. Moreover, enquiries have revealed that several extensive works are now being made by members of the cumulative index compiled by I. A. E. Robinson, which has recently been extended to embrace author, subject, year and illustrations by category. Presumably the cumulative index which is attractive use by members is kept on cards (or such as the Society's handouts, and it is at least heartening to know that most use is being made of it. However, the decision not to print annual indexes remains a sad one, because not everyone who receives the Transactions will live in, or near, Bath and, apart from the cards, the subscribers are kept up and many of our distant jour- nals. They cannot pop into the library to see the card index. The new format of the Halifiz is a great improvement over the old and nice it seems a great pity to have to reduce its scholarly use by restricting access to the information it publishes.

C. L.

The Indexer Vol. 19 No. 3 April 1995